CRITICAL RACE THEORY in ACADEMIC ADVISING

Presented by the Critical Race Theory Initiative Committee
Arts & Sciences Center for Academic Success

The University of New Mexico

Albuquerque Black Power March, 1970
UNM Land Acknowledgement

Founded in 1889, the University of New Mexico sits on the traditional homelands of the Pueblo of Sandia. The original peoples of New Mexico – Pueblo, Navajo, and Apache – since time immemorial, have deep connections to the land and have made significant contributions to the broader community statewide. We honor the land itself and those who remain stewards of this land throughout the generations and also acknowledge our committed relationship to Indigenous peoples. We gratefully recognize our history.
1. Introductions
2. What is Critical Race Theory (CRT) in Education?
3. Why use CRT in Advisement?
4. CRT Trainings and Initiative
5. Impacts of CRT-I
6. CRT Fallacies and Realities
7. Resources
8. Q/A
Farah Nousheen (she/her)

- A.A., North Seattle Community College, focus on Integrative Studies, 2006
- B.A., University of Washington, Comparative History of Ideas, minor in Diversity and Education, 2009
- M.A., University of New Mexico, American Studies, 2015
- Academic Advisor for multiple disciplines in Arts & Sciences:
  - Majors and Minors in the “Studies” - Africana, American, Chicana/o/x, International, Latin American, Religious; Women, Gender & Sexuality Studies
  - Minors Only: Asian Studies; Peace & Justice Studies; Sustainability Studies
  - Certificates: Peace & Justice Studies Certificate; Race & Social Justice Certificate

Identities:
woman of color, community organizer, cultural worker, healing facilitator, critical race theorist & practitioner
Danielle Berrien (she/her)

- B.S., University of Maine-Farmington, Family & Consumer Sciences
- M.Ed., Northern Arizona University, Counseling-Human Relations
- Transfer Education Specialist in the College of Arts & Sciences
  - Mellon Transfer Pathways Initiative – CNM to UNM Humanities

Other identities:
white woman, life partner, critical race student & practitioner
Bizzy Yung-Fong Hemphill (she/her)

- B.A., Swarthmore College, Sociology and Anthropology with a focus on Gender/Sexuality Studies, East Asian Studies, and Visual Anthropology
- M.A., University of California, Irvine, Visual Studies with a focus on History of Photography, Environmental Issues of the American West, Critical Theory
- Student Recruitment Specialist in the College of Arts & Sciences
- Lecturer in A&S Advisement

Other identities: mixed race (Chinese and White), queer, CRT student and practitioner
What is Critical Race Theory in Education?

1. What is Critical Race Theory (CRT)?

2. History of CRT

3. CRT in Education
Critical Race Theory is...

“...a framework that can be used to theorize, examine, and challenge the ways race and racism implicitly and explicitly impact social structures, practices, and discourses.”

Tara J. Yosso, 2005

“CRT addresses the social construct of race by examining the ideology of racism. CRT finds that racism is often well disguised in the rhetoric of shared ‘normative’ values and ‘neutral’ social scientific principles and practices”

Mari Matsuda, Charles Lawrence III, Richard Delgado, Kimberlé Crenshaw, 1993

Critical Race Theory considers the ways in which race, racism, and white supremacy impact all aspects of society, including law and education, and empowers students and practitioners to take actionable steps toward equity and justice.
A Brief Genealogy of CRT in Education

“The South believed an educated Negro to be a dangerous Negro. And the South was not wholly wrong; for education among all kinds of men always has had, and always will have, an element of danger and revolution, of dissatisfaction and discontent.”


1968-69: Student-led strikes against institutionalized racism bring about the formation of Ethnic Studies at UC Berkeley and SF State

1970: Student-led movements lead to the establishment of ethnicity-aware student support centers and programs in Black Studies, Chicano Studies, and Native American Studies at UNM

1970s – present: educational institutions incorporate Ethnic Studies curriculum, some backlash ensues

Barack Obama protesting with students at Harvard Law for more hiring of faculty of color, 1991. Via BuzzFeed
A Brief Genealogy of CRT in Education
Origins in Law

Late 1970s: predominantly white European and American scholars begin to use critical theory to critique legal systems.

Critical Legal Studies (CLS) scholars argue that law is not objective; rather, it is historically, politically, and socially contextual.

1989:
Led by Harvard Law Professor Derrick Bell, 30 legal scholars launch Critical Race Theory in Law.

These ideas have roots in the writings of W.E.B. DuBois, the Civil Rights movement, critical theory, CLS, and radical feminism.

CRT centralizes race in analyzing welfare, poverty, immigration, and crime.

“Unlike traditional civil rights, which embraces incrementalism and step-by-step progress, critical race theory questions the very foundations of the liberal order, including equality theory, legal reasoning, Enlightenment rationalism, and neutral principles of constitutional law.”

Richard Delgado and Jean Stefancic, 2001

Foundational article launches CRT of Education in 1995. Argues for:

- Race as an analytical tool for understanding school inequities
- Beyond multiculturalism; interdisciplinary analysis using law, social sciences, and humanities
- Intersection of race and property rights to see curriculum as intellectual property
- Calls educators to use CRT in education...

... and the CRT movement is launched!
Five Tenets of CRT in Education

1. Intercentricity of race and racism with other forms of subordination
   - race and racism are central to how U.S. society functions
   - intersectionality

2. The challenge to dominant ideology
   - objectivity, meritocracy, color-blindness, race neutrality
   - deficit-informed research

3. The commitment to social justice
   - equity vs. interest convergence

4. The centrality of experiential knowledge
   - lived experiences

5. The transdisciplinary perspective
   - what can we learn from other disciplines?
CRT in Education
Racial realism and empowerment

I define CRT in education as a theoretical and analytical framework that challenges the ways race and racism impact educational structures, practices, and discourses. CRT is conceived as a social justice project that works toward the liberatory potential of schooling. This acknowledges the contradictory nature of education, wherein schools most often oppress and marginalize while they maintain the potential to emancipate and empower.

When the ideology of racism is examined and racist injuries are named, victims of racism can often find their voice. Those injured by racism and other forms of oppression discover that they are not alone and moreover are part of a legacy of resistance.... They become empowered participants, hearing their own stories and the stories of others, listening to how the arguments against them are framed and learning to make the arguments to defend themselves.

Tara J. Yosso, 2005
CRT in Education

Valuing Cultural Capital

A traditional view of cultural capital is narrowly defined by White, middle class values...

The assumption follows that People of Color ‘lack’ the social and cultural capital required for social mobility. As a result, schools most often work from this assumption in structuring ways to help ‘disadvantaged’ students whose race and class background has left them lacking necessary knowledge, social skills, abilities and cultural capital.

CRT expands this view. Centering the research lens on the experiences of People of Color in critical historical context reveals accumulated assets and resources in the histories and lives of Communities of Color.

A CRT lens can ‘see’ that Communities of Color nurture cultural wealth through at least 6 forms of capital such as aspirational, navigational, social, linguistic, familial, and resistant capital...

Tara J. Yosso, 2005
Why Use CRT in Academic Advisement?

In any academic advising theoretical text or training, we refer to the "student" - who is that "student"?

For a moment, imagine the student. What color/race/gender/age was this student?

*If race is not considered in advising trainings/presentations/scholarship, then we assume that education is racially equitable!*

Race matters in academic advising!
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Student Services</th>
<th>Academic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student racialized experiences</strong></td>
<td>centered</td>
<td>not considered or discussed; referred to student services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Meritocracy</strong></td>
<td>considered though not central to &quot;success&quot;</td>
<td>Centered; high performing students are favored</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historical formation</strong></td>
<td>antiracist social movements in 1960s</td>
<td>curriculum; professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Staff experience of race</strong></td>
<td>race literacy and embodied experience is central to hiring</td>
<td>briefly considered in terms of &quot;diversity&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Systemic Racism</strong></td>
<td>central; somewhat to very intersectional</td>
<td>not considered or discussed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discipline or Department</strong></td>
<td>understands that students' major is going to impact experience of racism</td>
<td>not considered or discussed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why Use CRT in Academic Advisement?

"I think it’s important to explore more about colorblindness and antiracism. I fear some colleagues are not clear on these subjects."

- Joanna Camacho Escobar, A&S Management

What’s wrong with taking a “colorblind” approach? Just a few reasons....

◦ It is *not* antiracist, thus not actively not working to racial inequity
◦ Ignores realities experienced by BIPOC students
◦ Reinforces whiteness as norm
◦ Recognize that "meritocracy" and "academic preparedness" can gloss over true societal inequalities
Advisors as Gatekeepers

gatekeeper: a person or thing that controls access to something (Oxford)

advisors and advisement centers as gatekeepers control access to:

- racial justice courses and programs
- information about scholarships, funding, research opportunities
- interpersonal interactions that influence students

“Advisors play a pivotal role for retaining BIPOC students. My academic advisor encouraged me to continue with Biology. I have a lot of respect for advisors, and I am excited that undergraduate advisors are working on having a racial lens.”

– Diana Macias, Co-chair of the Diversity, Equity, Inclusivity Committee of UNM Biology Graduate Students
"But...what can I do?"

gatekeeper: a person or thing that controls access to something (Oxford)

➢ Stay informed social justice and racial justice degree options at your university, i.e. ethnic studies, women/gender studies, peace & justice, etc. Reach out to those advisors!
  ➢ Minor? Elective courses? Events?

➢ Ask all students (BIPOC or not) if they are interested in social justice. If yes, then provide options for adding it to their degree plan.

➢ Research into the history of your discipline as well as the interventions made by scholars of color, i.e. Black feminist thought in Women Studies.

➢ Stay informed of student critiques and movements at department level, university level, and also national level

➢ PLANTING "SEEDS" WITH EVENTS AND SMALL PROJECTS IN THE DEPARTMENT
• Farah’s presentation of advisement of intersectionality at 2019 Critical Race Studies of Education Association at University of Southern California
• Attended by Dr. Nancy Lopez and others at UNM. Building an antiracist community.
• Learned about "CRiTWalking", racing statistics, disability and race, call to (cis)men for feminism, intersectionality!
• Received excellent feedback for presentation; intersectionality in POC spaces dismantles white supremacy by allowing POC to look at internalized forms of racism, rather than be stuck at Race 101.
• Gained affirmation and confidence in furthering leadership
• Supported by DEI, A&S Advisement, and Advisement
Remember! CRT recognizes that we are in for the long haul. Racism is permanent and endemic.

- CRT Presentations at NACADA 2016 in Santa Fe; 2016 Advisor Institute; 2017 Advisor Institute; 2018 A&S training.
- 2016/17 - Liaison roles established with ethnic centers and other student centers
- Some advisors began attending Institute of "Race" monthly meetings
- October 2018: Black Student Association Solidarity Statement:

We affirm that it is of grave importance that all units at UNM, not only sororities and fraternities, take steps to foster a safer campus climate for African American students, faculty, and staff. At Arts & Sciences Advisement, we are committed to increasing our knowledge about structural and all forms of racism. We value partnerships with Student Affairs and have established liaison roles with each of the ethnic centers in order to further our awareness involving the diverse needs of UNM’s student populations. We are committed to utilizing available resources, such as courses in Africana Studies and other critical studies majors and minors, Undoing Racism trainings, and the stalwart leadership provided by the Institute for the Study of “Race” and Social Justice.

- Attendance and volunteering by A&S advisors at 2018 Critical Race Studies of Education Association conference hosted by UNM
- Expand our knowledge through various presentations
- Networking with scholars and attendees
- Supported by management to take time off to attend conference
- Informed about what we learned at the conference
May 2020. Letter of support of Africana Studies after the Director's life was threatened by online bullying:

In conclusion, as Academic Advisors are wont to do, we offer some advice: as a form of support, we encourage any and all UNM students, staff, and community members to enroll in Africana Studies courses. We encourage our fellow advisors across the university to discuss Africana Studies courses and programs with your students and how Africana Studies can complement any degree plan. We would also like to inform everyone about the undergraduate Arts & Sciences Race and Social Justice Certificate. UNM staff, undergraduates, and community members can earn this certificate by taking approved courses focused on race from any of the UNM departments and programs.

This letter of support was printed in the Daily Lobo and sent out on various listservs. Notice that we pointed directly to degree curriculum: Race & Social Justice Certificate.

When the Summer 2020 uprising of Black Lives Matter hit the world, these seeds were already planted!
Critical Race Theory Training

June 25, 2020. Presented a recap of training session as a response to #blacklivesmatter included watching clips of Townhall on anti-blackness at UNM, Juneteenth, and Ruha Benjamin on humanities.

"I have a lot of gratitude that this department is giving space for this work to happen. It was very heartening to see how many people showed up and are interested in engaging. I'm excited to move forward in a meaningful manner. When I say meaningful, I mean some serious self-examination of internal biases and of higher education as a whole, reflection, and tangible changes for this institution and for ourselves as individuals with direct student contact acting on behalf of the institution." - Bizzy Yung-Fong Hemphill

- Overwhelmingly, advisors asked for another training the following month.

- An advisor wanted to discuss "Who is not in the room!?" Advisors felt that advisors must be accountable to the reasons of not attending a meeting on antiracism.

- Management discussed the possibility mandatory trainings along with BOM

- Supervisor William McClary drafted the CRT-Initiative that was approved by the Dean’s Office and Human Resources

- We began to think about a CRT-I Committee to organize monthly trainings and support antiracism efforts across campus
Critical Race Theory Initiative in UNM A&S Advising

From our mission statement:

In order to build upon the A&S mission to develop cross-culturally literate citizens through the college’s broad-based degree programs, it is essential to ensure that A&S staff members are adequately prepared to address aspects of racial realism and how it factors into the preparation for student success. The CRTI is designed to facilitate trainings and discussions that enhance A&S staff members’ comprehension of inclusive excellence. A&S believes that the CRTI is a useful tool to help its staff members continue to grow and develop ways in which to counter racism at UNM and beyond. It affords each of us an informed and educated lens to examine and grasp current events and cultivate our own personal philosophy. A&S is dedicated to integrating the CRTI training with UNM’s expectations aligned with Guiding Principles and Interpersonal Relationships in order to be more effective allies to students and colleagues.
CRT Initiative Committee

• Mission of the CRT-I Committee:
  • Develop cross-cultural literacy through degree programs
  • Help advisors to interpret the UNM Diversity requirement
  • Advance communications with ethnic studies programs, departments, and faculty
  • Expose students to majors, minors and certificates that highlight equality, race and justice
  • Specifically, utilize the theory and praxis of Critical Race Theory that works as a tool to solve problems of institutionalized racism with all its intersections
  • Respond appropriately to racism on campus, city, or nation
  • Plan monthly mandatory trainings for A&S advisement staff
CRT-I Trainings

August 6th, 2020. First mandatory training integrated into monthly staff meetings.

UCLA presentation on Legal Studies. Unpacked Yosso more carefully. And most important had advisors fill out surveys.

I hope that we can continue to approach our students from a positive, strengths-based approach where we help them recognize the wealth of cultural capital that they are coming to UNM with, especially for our Native American students who often feel like they may not belong at UNM or realize the cultural capital they come with.

- Catherine Montoya, Sr. Academic Advisor, Native American Studies

Are BIPOC students disproportionally represented in pre-STEM students that don’t move forward in major due to math? Are there majors in STEM that have courses with math prerequisites that use those prerequisites more to block students than prepare students for the content in that course? (Such as calculus for BIOL 303 Ecology and Evolution?)

- Karen Majors, Sr. Academic Advisor
I’d like to talk about intersectionality and layering of identity.

- Maria Held, Sr. Academic Advisor, Biology

I appreciate the breaking down of CRT tenets. Sometimes we think we know what words and concepts mean, but once you examine the definition, you realize maybe I don’t really know what epistemology means.

- Jennifer Serrano, Sr. Academic Advisor, Psychology

How/what metrics can we use to be more inclusive of the cultural capital? GPA, especially for scholarships, is not the best marker. Having a minimum of a 3.5 or similar for some of the A&S scholarships leaves out a lot of students that have these other wonderful things they bring to UNM. I’d like to see us evaluate how we evaluate funding & scholarships at least in A&S.

- Nita Kelly, Sr. Academic Advisor, Sociology

CRT-I Trainings
CRT-I Trainings

Sept 2020
- Focus on student social movements, Biology graduate students' critique
- Social Change: added Land Acknowledgement to beginning of our monthly all-staff meetings (not just CRT portion)

Oct 2020
- Updates of UNM grad student movements (psychology, sociology), Intersectionality of advisors and reading Kimberlé Crenshaw

Nov 2020
- Continue intersectionality; bring together advising theories with CRT; formulate list for advisors

Dec 2020
- Recap of terminology (esp. Colorblindness), discussion on how advisors have (or have not) used CRT lens in advising

Feb 2021
- Local violence against indigenous people by park ranger, history of National Parks and Indigenous genocide, role of universities in indigenous disenfranchisement
- Supervisor Will McClary wins NACADA award – what does it mean to prioritize race in academic work and in award applications?

March 2021
- Advising white students, Critical Whiteness Studies, Colorblind Feminism
CRT Fallacies and Realities

Government memo, September 4th, 2020

• **Claim:** "The divisive, false, and demeaning propaganda of the critical race theory movement is contrary to all we stand for as Americans and should have no place in the Federal government."

• **Reality:** One of the reasons we chose CRT as our approach is that it is NOT divisive or false; rather it centers extensive research and aims to end "racism, sexism, and poverty" (Solarzano and others). We do, though, firmly believe that it is essential for us working in education to recognize our own participation in structures of power, how we may be unconsciously reinforcing racial inequality, and how we can work to promote educational equity.

• **Reality:** "Critical race theory embraced the transformative vision of the long civil rights movement, replete with partial victories won through painful, protracted struggle, including the Reconstruction amendments to the Constitution after the Civil War and the Civil Rights and Voting Rights acts of the 1960s. This is what we mean when we speak of institutional or systemic racism that remains endemic in the United States despite one and a half centuries of 'civil rights reforms.' If this makes us anti-American, we stand as charged. But critical race scholars argue that true patriotism is the willingness to criticize your nation, precisely because we seek to bring it closer to its post-Civil War ideals of equality and anti-subordination." (Laura E. Gómez, September 11, 2020)
CRT Fallacies and Realities

Helen Raleigh, Newsweek Op-Ed, March 9, 2021

• **Claim:** "Critical race theory (CRT) is a divisive, discriminatory ideology that judges people on the basis of their skin color....Few are willing to speak out against it for fear of being labeled racists or white supremacists."

• **Reality:** CRT is not discriminatory; it seeks to dismantle overt and covert discrimination. It does not judge people on the basis of their skin color. It does, however, take race seriously as a lens through which we examine social structures. Because we take race seriously as a factor in one’s everyday experience does not mean we judge someone by their skin color.

• **Claim:** CRT is anti-Asian because Asians value hard work and meritocracy, and CRT "attacks these as ‘white’ values and the people who practice them as acting ‘white’." 

• **Reality:** "Asian Americans are at the center of CRT analysis and have been from the start... I participated in the first published symposium of Critical Race Theory scholarship, with an article... on reparations for Japanese Americans and Native Hawaiians. I co-authored the first CRT book, *Words That Wound*, centering analysis of hate crimes against Asian Americans. I used CRT analysis to write the first law review article on accent discrimination... based on case studies of Filipino and Native Hawaiian litigants. In *We Won’t Go Back*, I used CRT to analyze Asian American responses to affirmative action. I have applied CRT to develop a course on Asian Americans and the law, first at UCLA and then at Georgetown. This work was foundational Critical Race Theory, developed by unpacking anti-Asian racism through a historical and structural analysis of US racism. All of it came out of struggle: real issues and real needs in Asian American communities. That is what Critical Race Theory is, and Asians have been at the center of it." (Mari Matsuda, March 12, 2021)

• **Reality:** Analyzing educational research through a CRT lens demonstrates that lumping Asian students together as a homogenous model minority group ignores significant academic attainment discrepancies. (See Museus and Kang, 2009; Teranishi *et al.*, 2009)
Thanks for the shoutout for CRT! We appreciate the increase in teachable moments.

CRT is an excellent tool for the "long Civil Rights movement" as its end goal is to end oppression in all forms through a multidisciplinary perspective. A continued eye on systemic racism leaves little room for it to hide.

All forms of antiracism work (CRT, diversity, antiracism, critical whiteness, etc.), trainings, meetings, interventions, statements, research, art, must continue!

The Management Team views this as an unacceptable attack on people of color and education that only serves to demonstrate how truly critical Critical Race Theory is. We will continue moving forward with this initiative as a unified Advisement Center, as our colleagues and students of color need us to understand and stand in support of their education, well-being, and their human rights to the very best of our ability. The Arts & Sciences CRT Initiative Statement is attached for your review regarding the importance of this work to our professional and personal development.

- A&S Advisement Management Team

I, for one, am happy this training is continuing in A&S Advisement. I find it quite rewarding – and also alarming – that the CRT training taking place across the country, but mainly at The University of New Mexico, occupies enough space in the current administration’s head that they feel a memo condemning it was necessary.

- Cory Muñoz, Sr. Academic Advisor, Communication & Journalism, Pre-Law Society Advisor
Gaining CRT Literacy

Education – individually and collectively
- Reading books, articles, academic journals, case studies, blogs of theorists...
- Podcasts and other audio media
- Documentaries, movies and other visual media
- Book study groups
- Campus, community, or national - conferences and events

Practice – individually and collectively
- Develop advising mission statement reflecting CRT tenets for yourself and/or your department
- Review practices – as an advisor, department, and college
- Review policies - as an advisor, department, and college
- Support efforts at your institution, locally, and nationally
Gaining CRT Literacy

- UNM Institute for the Study of "Race" and Social Justice
- UNM Arts & Sciences Advisement - CRT-I blog coming soon
- Critical Race Studies in Education Association

NACADA resources

- NACADA Social Justice Clearinghouse
- NACADA Race, Ethnicity, and Inclusion Work Group
- Academic Advising Resources In Response to Black Lives Matter
- Expanding Your Comfort Zone: Cultural Competency in Academic Advising
Critical Whiteness Studies

Ruth Frankenberg (1993), a White British-American feminist, theorizes “whiteness” in three dimensions:

1) location of structural advantage and racial privilege
2) a “standpoint” from where White people view themselves, others, and society
3) a set of often unnamed, unmarked cultural practices

Frankenberg published foundational intersectional research on White women’s understanding of race.
Critical Whiteness Studies

Early foundational texts:


Critical White Studies – latest scholarship

- https://aaas.duke.edu/people/eduardo-bonilla-silva
- Twitter @IjeomaOluo
- https://www.robindiangelo.com/accountability-statement/
- https://www.eddiemoorejr.com/21daychallenge

*Note: Robin DiAngelo, Tim Wise and other white scholars/authors of whiteness studies have been critiqued for profiting off racism and centering whiteness. When considering these sources, observe if/how the individual/organization has created accountability to people and communities of color – by recognizing their POC influences, contribution to communities and agencies serving POC, etc.
Questions & Answers

Thank you! Questions?

Bizzy Hemphill: ehemphill@unm.edu
Farah Nousheen: nousheen@unm.edu
Danielle Berrien: dberrien@unm.edu